

City of McCall AOI**From:** Donna Jacobs [REDACTED] >**Sent:** Saturday, July 5, 2025 7:38:53 AM**To:** Valley County Commissioners <commissioners@valleycountyid.gov>; Katlin Caldwell <kcaldwell@valleycountyid.gov>; nthompson@valleycountyid.gov <nthompson@valleycountyid.gov>; Sherry Maupin <smaupin@valleycountyid.gov>**Subject:** City of McCall AOI

Dear commissioners,

Thank you for your hard work on behalf of Valley County. I am writing to submit comments on the current issue of the impact area around Payette Lake.

History

Our family has been in McCall since 1912

We purchased our property from Emmett Fruit people as part of the Falk exchange in 1912. Seven generations have been here.

Property

Our property is 1.63 acres on Chipmunk Trail on the West side lakefront.

Comments

As has long been the case it is important to allow the City of McCall to do the heavy lifting when it comes to regulating the area around the lake especially including the endowment land on the west side. The Department of Lands needs to make that property productive but the city and property owners need to keep the water and viewshed intact and healthy. The intent of the recent AOI law was to keep cities from extending their reach too far. That is not happening in McCall, for example the sewer reaches well past the WagonWheel bay neighborhood and has reasonable capacity for growth.

An area like McCall will attract many developers because there has always been a ready market, but extra steps to keep the area healthy and maintained are welcomed by good local developers. This is the only long term strategy appropriate for everyone's benefit and value.

McCall currently has the infrastructure, the regulations, and importantly the zoning and personnel in place.

I recommend McCall be allowed local control over the areas it has requested as well as the area completely around the Payette Lake which will reasonably be served by city services in a similar period of time.

An important medical appointment prevents me from being at the meeting but I am hoping my comments are helpful.

Sincerely

Donna Day Jacobs
910 Chipmunk Trail

City of McCall Area of Impact**From:** Jeff Canfield [REDACTED]**Sent:** Friday, July 4, 2025 8:45:48 AM**To:** Valley County Commissioners <commissioners@valleycountyid.gov>; Jeff Canfield [REDACTED]**Subject:** City of McCall Area of Impact

Valley County Commissioners:

People who bought or built homes in the current McCall Area of Impact did so with the understanding that zoning restrictions would protect their property during anticipated growth in the future. Taking this protection away from them and replacing it with the county's multiple use concept for deciding whether or not projects may be granted, without specific zoning protections, is not right. Please schedule a public hearing in McCall at a time when all can attend and allow time to solicit comments from the public. This issue should be fully discussed and analysed with input from all concerned.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Jeff Canfield
McCall

VCC hearing July 7, 2025**From:** Eva Prince [REDACTED]**Sent:** Friday, July 4, 2025 9:00:09 AM**To:** Valley County Commissioners <commissioners@valleycountyid.gov>**Subject:** VCC hearing July 7, 2025

Dear Commissioners:

The recent article in the McCall Star News reports that the Valley County Commissioners (VCC) is holding an extremely important public hearing regarding the City of McCall Area of Impact (AOI) next week.

That singularly scheduled meeting is being held at a time and date that renders itself nearly impossible for effective public input. The current zoning protections of the AOI are of importance to many in and around our city of McCall. I request the VCC to add additional opportunities for citizens to hear the rationale for changes to the AOI by adding meetings for public participation prior to any decision directly impacting proximal land uses and growth into the future.

Respectfully,
Eva Prince 317 N. Mission St
McCall, ID 83638

City Impact Hearing - Comment

From: MELANIE DAVIDSON - HICKEY [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, July 3, 2025 12:47 PM
To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: City Impact Hearing - Comment

Hi Cynda,

I know I am a little late, but I am writing in response to the upcoming hearing regarding amending the McCall Impact Area Boundary.

Although I am a new owner to 481 Ellis Road, McCall, Idaho, I am a McCall native. My family moved to McCall when I was 1 year old. I am a McCall-Donnelly Class of 93 graduate, and my parents are retired MDHS school teachers and local business owners. McCall is my home and my heart.

I understand the efforts required by the city and county in the boundary changes. My specific concern is the area to remain in the impact zone (and likely to be annexed within 5 years) North of Krahn Lane and East of Samson Trail. My property is 3 acres, and lies right within the new boundary of the potential impact zone. If Krahn Lane were to continue through to the East past where it currently dead ends, it would continue right along the South boundary of my property. We purchased this property specifically because it was out of the City limits and had "elbow room" from current and potential future neighbors.

Most of the parcel East of Samson trail, North of Krahn to Stockton, are existing homes with existing well, septic, and/or individual building lots. I do not see the need for this area to need city services or benefit from annexation in any way. I am not an opponent of proper growth, but the residents of Ellis Road are established, and will not have the future need of city services.

I am writing in request to consider this area as not being included in the new city impact area.

I appreciate your time and consideration.

Thank you!
Melanie Hickey



Reduction of the McCall Impact Area

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Sunday, July 6, 2025 9:55 AM
To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: Reduction of the McCall Impact Area

To the Valley County Commissioners;

Our family has been a part of this community for over 30 years. We own two homes here and have watched while our unique community and surroundings have been systematically overrun with commercial development. Take the beautiful drive up 55 from the South and you will see 3 new boats dealerships, a number of boat storage condos, and huge cranes developing the pristine landscape. To the Commissioners, please listen to b your constituents, WE DO NOT WANT THIS OVERDEVELOPMENT TO DESTROY OUR COUNTY'S BEAUTY. If anything, the impact area should be expanded.

Derk Brill
947 Lick Creek Road
McCall

McCall Area of Impact

From: Molly Conein [REDACTED]
Sent: Sunday, July 6, 2025 10:41 AM
To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: McCall Area of Impact

As a McCall home owner and resident of Valley County, I strongly oppose the removal of the area of impact. I stand with the statement below and while the council has proven to be untrustworthy, I hope they will do what the combined voice of the community wants and not what they, or their friends personally want.

The Area of Impact helps ensure growth around McCall is thoughtful and coordinated. Removing this planning partnership with the County could lead to:

- Potential development near Payette Lake without strong environmental protections, including on State-owned public land around the lake that may eventually be sold or leased
- Commercial activity, industrial activity, and businesses in and around residential areas
- Increase of large storage and metal structures and other unsightly development in scenic areas and corridors
- Increased traffic and roadway demand that is uncoordinated with the current transportation system
- Loss of community character and long-term planning consistency

Thank you,

Molly Johnson

Mccall impact area**From:** john c malvich [REDACTED]**Sent:** Saturday, July 5, 2025 2:27 PM**To:** Valley County Commissioners <commissioners@valleycountyid.gov>**Subject:** Mccall impact area

I was born and raised here, dumb old logger who does not like the city of Mccall having the say so over this area. They can not take care of what's in city limits let alone what is going on outside of city limits. The way the city's direction, is too much like Sun Valley, we need to be McCall. We already have people having to live in new meadows, council, donnelly, because of their decisions, we don't need them running off businesses because they don't want to see unsightly buildings. So in other words i want county to say so more people so more ideas not depending on tree huggers. Thanks john malvich

Area of Impact Concerns**From:** Lynn Siegel [REDACTED]**Sent:** Friday, July 4, 2025 8:04 PM**To:** Valley County Commissioners <commissioners@valleycountyid.gov>**Subject:** Area of Impact Concerns

County Commissioners:

In fairness to current property owners, the established McCall Area of Impact zoning ordinances need to be factored into any changes the county may make to future land use.

Please consider property owners' rights as you move forward.

Thank you.

Lynn Siegel

McCall

Area of impact McCall

From: Scotty Davenport [REDACTED]
Sent: Sunday, July 6, 2025 11:05:43 AM
To: Katlin Caldwell <kcaldwell@valleycountyid.gov>; Sherry Maupin <smaupin@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Area of impact McCall

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Scotty Davenport** <[REDACTED]>
Date: Sun, Jul 6, 2025 at 8:58 AM
Subject: Area of impact McCall
To: Katlin Caldwell <kcaldwell@valleycounty.id.gov>, Neil Thompson <nthompson@valleycountyid.gov>, Shery Maupin <smaupin@valleycountyid.gov>

Hello Hope your 4th was fun and safe
I request you to continue following the state law and exercise your opportunity to listen to the area of impact residence. Who do not want to pay McCall city taxes to justify McCall city planners getting more Public Planning Awards.

The city can not service the city residents who pay taxes. The city should fix their internal infrastructure first.

Respectfully Submitted Scotty D city of mccall resident

McCall Area of impact

From: James Wolf [REDACTED]
Sent: Sunday, July 6, 2025 3:44 PM
To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: McCall Area of impact

I object to Valley County's power grab, taking control over development around Payette Lake. Like many residents, I value the area's rural character and every-man ambience. We have already gentrified to the degree that local employees can't afford to live in McCall. I don't want to see mansions and estates standing shoulder-to-shoulder around the lake, "No Trespassing" signs everywhere. Sun Valley anyone?

I ask the governing administration to allow debate in a CONVENIENT open forum, not held on a post-holiday Monday when working people are busy working. Perhaps put the question on the next ballot! Let McCall and Payette Lake belong to the people, not wealthy developers and oligarchs!

James Wolf
932 Brentwood St
McCall ID

Area of Impact Change

From: Dinu Mistry [REDACTED]
Sent: Sunday, July 6, 2025 10:32 PM
To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: Area of Impact Change

I am writing to express grave concerns about the change to the Area of Impact in McCall. The County is essentially doing a land grab and this change will diminish the protections to the land around the lake and the quality of the water. My concerns are:

- loss of appropriate set-backs around the lake
- poor review of land use, to include introducing commercial use into residential areas
- loss of water quality in the lake which is currently a primary source of drinking water for many residents

McCall is a jewel that needs protection. The City and the County must work together, as they have for almost 50 years.

This issue deserves public hearings at times when all (seriously, the Monday after July 4th at 2 pm??) can attend-or better yet, an election where all can vote.

Thank you,
Dinu Mistry Wolf
932 Brentwood
McCall, Idaho

Dear Valley County Commissioners,

We are in favor of the proposed reduction of the McCall Impact Area. One caveat we have is that the County includes reasonable and proper requirements for properties bordering any public waterways, and for all other properties for that matter.

Please include our comments in the public record regarding this issue.

Thank you,

Phil and JoEllen Yribar
2280 Payette Drive
P.O. Box 694
McCall, ID 83638

--

JoEllen & Phil Yribar

Associate Broker, GRI, SRES, RSPS/Realtors, CLHMS
McCall Real Estate Company
301 E. Lake Street
McCall, ID 83638

Jo Cell: 208-634-6494

Phil Cell: 208-630-3083

Office: 208-634-2100

Fax: 208-634-3719

Jo email: joellen.yribar@mccallrealestate.com

Phil email: phil.yribar@mccallrealestate.com

Web site: www.mccallidrealestate.com

"McCall's Lakefront Specialists"

Designations:

CLHMS - Certified Luxury Home Marketing Specialist & Million Dollar Guild Members of the

Institute for Luxury Home Marketing

RSPS - Resort & Second-Home Property Specialist

SRES - Senior Real Estate Specialist

GRI - Graduate Realtor Institute

When Experience Counts:

Valley County property owner for over 60 years

Full-Time REALTORS since 1994

Over 30 Years Experience

Electronic Privacy Notice. This email, and any attachments, contains information that is, or may be, covered by electronic communications privacy laws, and is also confidential and proprietary in nature. If you are not the intended recipient, please be advised that you are legally prohibited from retaining, using, copying, distributing, or otherwise disclosing this information in any manner. Instead, please reply to the sender that you have received this communication in error, and then immediately delete it. Thank you in advance for your cooperation.

McCall AOI Concern

From: Tor Andersen [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, July 7, 2025 9:23 AM
To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>
Subject: McCall AOI Concern

Dear Valley County Commissioners,

My name is Tor Anderen and am a full time resident of McCall. I am asking that you please consider adopting the AOI boundary as proposed by the City of McCall. I am extremely concerned about the county's mixed use and more relaxed zoning as it pertains to Payette Lake, our drinking water, and to the visual and esthetic impact on McCall.

It appears the only criteria used by Valley County in establishing their proposed AOI boundary is using a very small area that the City of McCall can expand its sewer system to within the next 5 years. This one criteria apparently being used is simply one of many recommended criteria to guide the boundaries, but seems it's being used as an absolute to intentionally shrink the McCall AOI to the smallest area possible. Whether or not this is Valley County's intent or not, it is certainly the appearance to the residents of McCall. To shrink the impact area by 97% and throw away 47 years years of joint effort between Valley County and the City of McCall does not sit well with me or most of McCall's residents that I have talked to.

As our elected officials, I ask you to please consider adopting AOI boundaries that are more in line with what the City of McCall has proposed.

I would also like to ask that you consider extending your decision to provide another public hearing in McCall, where those that are most affected by this actually have a chance to attend. Today's hearing is scheduled in the middle of most peoples work day, and comes at the end of our biggest holiday in McCall, bringing crowded roads to what is already an inconvenient drive for most.

Thank you for your consideration,
Tor Andersen
Sent from my iPhone

July 7, 2025

To: Valley County Commissioners:

Subject: Comments Regarding Proposed Changes to City of McCall's AOI Boundary

As resident in McCall's Area of Impact (AOI) for over 18 years, I am very concerned about the approach that Valley County Commissioners are taking regarding proposed changes to the City of McCall's AOI boundary.

Problem # 1: A solution looking for a problem. When Senator Todd Lakey (District 12) introduced his bill which ultimately passed and was signed into law as 2024 Idaho Code Title 67 - STATE GOVERNMENT AND STATE AFFAIRS Chapter 65 - LOCAL LAND USE PLANNING Section 67-6526 - AREAS OF IMPACT. His stated goal was **“to find ways to increase communications between cities with AOI's in close proximity to each other to prevent conflicts and to prevent AOI's that are far beyond where cities expect to provide services:”** In other words, his legislation was trying to fix a local problem in the Treasure Valley between the Cities of Star and Middleton and to some extent an AOI for SW Boise with a “one size fits all” bill that assumes that the problem exists everywhere in the State of Idaho. Government overreach at its best.

Problem #2: the County's proposed AOI boundary has the potential to create more problems than it solves. Please focus on the stated purpose of Senator Lackey's bill: **“to find ways to increase communications (and presumably) between cities” (and presumably their county leaders).** By eliminating 97% of the existing AOI for McCall also eliminates about 100% of the communication between the City and the County. This is the opposite of what is needed.

Problem #3: Modern P&Z Regulatory Framework vs. an outdated compatibility matrix system. Valley County is one of only 3 counties in Idaho that use an outdated compatibility matrix system which is guided by its Comprehensive Plan which is also outdated and overdue for overhaul. This approach to land use planning leaves too much discretion to elected officials. It also lacks specificity for developers and the general public. McCall has (using public involvement) identified long-term goals for the City as well as established clear zoning categories so the public and developers know what the future looks like in terms of development. Adequate and clear zoning is a critical phase in the development of a community because it provides the ability to shape the character of neighborhoods and influence the growth patterns. There are no secrets!

Problem #4: A stew of development: Reducing the size of McCall's AOI, increases the potential for threats to McCall and the surrounding environments. These include: growth and development in a haphazard way, surprises developments such as large storage facilities being built next to residential subdivisions or industrial operations suddenly being allowed to set up on the outskirts of the city limits. These are examples that could ultimately and permanently change the character of McCall, negatively affecting its many amenity resources (scenery, lakes, mountains, etc.) and increasing threats to the area's natural resources including water quality, increased wild fires, air quality, scenic resources, transportation issues and much more.

Valley County's approach at interpreting Chapter 65 - LOCAL LAND USE PLANNING Section 67-6526 - AREAS OF IMPACT is misguided and not really necessary. The law simply states that current AOI's need to be reviewed on a 5-year cycle and that boundary's should not be larger than what is expected to be annexed within 5 years. It also requires City's and Counties to maintain good working relationships in order to manage growth in partnerships and in ways that are compatible with public desires and needs.

The City of McCall has worked for years (47 to be exact) to ensure that development and growth in the City and the adjacent AOI are compatible with their Comprehensive Plan and the desires of local residents. My fear is that unless Valley County manages growth and development consistent with current zoning in the AOI, that ultimately we will see less regulated development that could impact ground water, increase the risk of pollution in Valley County's crown jewel, Payette Lake and surrounding watersheds. In addition, we will likely see an increased risk of wild and man-caused fires as the urban interface expands with more building in areas at-risk of fires.

Thank You,
Sincerely,
Jan & Cal McCluskey
711 Chad Drive
McCall, ID 83638

McCall Development Impact Zone Change

From: James S. [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday, July 7, 2025 11:52 AM

To: Valley County Commissioners <commissioners@valleycountyid.gov>

Subject: McCall Development Impact Zone Change

I am writing as I'm very disappointed and discouraged about the seemingly about face on the McCall Impact Zone Map. Whereas our address and development was included, now it appears it's been excluded. Indeed, many owners in our development completed home builds based on the previous inclusion plans. That's very disingenuous, and certainly not a show of good faith.

I strongly request, even demand you to RETAIN all areas previously included and communicated to homeowners, in the McCall Impact Zone Map.

My property is in the White Cloud subdivision and approximately 25% of our lots are included in the original Impact Zone. Several of us bought lots specifically within the Impact Zone in anticipation that it would lead to annexation. We've partnered with the fire department on fire abatement clearing, investigated fire water retention infrastructure, and other actions all with that incorporation understanding and in good faith. As stated above, many who have already built have been subject to the McCall P&Z guidelines which have required modifications to suit the city codes which are different from the Valley County codes. To subject us to those requirements under the understanding of incorporation into the McCall impact zone, then to remove that, is the most bitter pill and poor show of the City of McCall I've seen.

Please leave those areas on the revised map!

James Sneddon
Principal Owner

13 Haymaker Place
McCall, ID 83638

Formal Protest Regarding the Proposed Reduction of the City of McCall Impact Area

From: Kay Harwood [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday, July 7, 2025 1:38 PM

To: Cynda Herrick <cherrick@valleycountyid.gov>

Cc: [REDACTED]

Subject: Formal Protest Regarding the Proposed Reduction of the City of McCall Impact Area

To the Honorable Valley County Commissioners,

Valley County Courthouse
219 North Main Street
Cascade, ID 83611

Dear Commissioners,

My husband and I are lifelong Idahoans and have owned a home in the city of McCall that we built around 2006.

We are 100% against any changes to the proposed McCall area of impact and request a NO vote at the upcoming meeting.

We agree whole heartedly with all of the detail in attached letter.

Thank you for your thoughtful attention to this issue.

Kirk and Kay Harwood
1320 Bitterroot
McCall

REFERENCED LETTER:

Dear Commissioners,

I am writing to formally express my profound concern and strong protest regarding the recent decision or proposed action to reduce the designated City of McCall Impact Area. This decision, if finalized, represents a significant step backward for responsible growth, coordinated planning, and the long-term well-being of both the City of McCall and Valley County as a whole.

The concept of an "Impact Area" is fundamentally designed to facilitate harmonious development at the urban-rural interface, ensuring that areas immediately adjacent to a city's boundaries develop in a manner consistent with the city's comprehensive plan and its ability to provide essential services. A reduction in this critical planning zone threatens to undermine decades of collaborative effort and foresight.

My primary concerns stem from several critical areas:

1. **Uncontrolled and Uncoordinated Growth:** Reducing the Impact Area will inevitably lead to fragmented and uncoordinated development immediately outside McCall's new, smaller boundary. This "sprawl" will lack the necessary

planning oversight, potentially resulting in inconsistent zoning, inadequate infrastructure, and a diminished quality of life for residents in these areas.

2. **Strain on City Services:** Properties developing just beyond a reduced impact area will still inevitably rely on McCall's public services, including water, sewer, police, fire, and emergency response. Without the ability to plan for and integrate these areas, the City of McCall will bear the burden of extending services without the benefit of coordinated development fees or annexation, placing an undue financial strain on existing city taxpayers.
3. **Loss of Environmental Protection:** The McCall area is renowned for its pristine natural beauty, including the health of Payette Lake and the surrounding watershed. A diminished Impact Area could lead to less stringent environmental regulations and oversight for development in ecologically sensitive areas, risking irreversible damage to our shared natural resources.
4. **Erosion of Community Vision:** The City of McCall has a comprehensive plan that reflects the community's vision for its future. A reduced Impact Area undermines this vision by allowing development that may not align with the community's desired character, density, or aesthetic, ultimately eroding the unique appeal of McCall.
5. **Economic Implications:** Coordinated growth and a well-planned community are essential for long-term economic stability and tourism. Fragmented development and strained services could negatively impact property values, deter future investment, and diminish McCall's standing as a premier destination.

I urge the Valley County Commissioners to reconsider this decision. Instead of reducing the Impact Area, I implore you to engage in renewed collaborative discussions with the City of McCall to ensure that future growth in our region is managed thoughtfully, sustainably, and in a manner that benefits all residents of Valley County. Maintaining a robust and appropriately sized Impact Area is not about control; it is about responsible stewardship of our land, resources, and community future.

Thank you for your time and consideration of this critical matter. I look forward to your thoughtful response and, more importantly, a commitment to preserving the integrity of our planning processes.

Sincerely,

Jen and Kole Harwood
1112 Blue Haze Way
McCall, ID 83638